Srimoyee Mukherjee Advocate HIGH COURT CALCUTTA

Mobile: 9674254576

Email: srimoyee.mukherjee2015@gmail.com 73A Banamali Naskar Road, Behala, Kolkata 700 060 Bar Association Room No. 4

To,

The Learned Government Pleader, High Court at Calcutta.

> Re: W.P.A. (P) 594 of 2022 Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) & Another -Versus-The State of West Bengal and others.

Dear Madam/Sir(s),

Please find enclosed herewith a copy of the above mentioned writ petition along with all its annexure which has been filed before the Hon'ble High Court at Calcutta on behalf of the petitioners on 29.22,2022 and it is likely to be taken up for hearing before His Lordships the Hon'ble Chief Justice Prakash Shrivastava and Hon'ble Mr. Justice Rajarshi Bharadwaj. The matter will appear on 06.12.2022 or as soon as the business of the Hon'ble Court permits.

This is for your kind information and necessary action.

Thanking you,

Yours faithfully,

Shimoyee-Mukkenjes Advocate Enclosed: As above 30/11/2022

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W. P. A. (P) 594 of 2022 In the Matter of: Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) and Anr

.....Petitioners

-Versus-

State of West Bengal &Ors

.....Respondents

SYNOPSIS

Four under trial persons died an unnatural death while in the custody of the state authorities over a period of less than 5 days in the same district correctional home, namely Baruipur Correctional Home, South 24 Parganas. The said persons were picked up by the police authorities on the allegation of being connected with separate criminal cases. When the family members met them in custody, they were informed by the inmates that they were fine but soon thereafter the information of their deaths reached the family members. The post mortem report indicates physical violence on all the deceased. It is the duty of the State authorities to explain the reason for such injury and subsequent death of the individuals who were in their custody at the relevant point of time.

The petitioners, being Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) and its general secretary, are committed to highlighting and to bring to the judicial notice how the personal modesty, decency, dignity on arrest of a person, both in police as well as judicial custody, is increasingly exposed to third-degree practices which, as in this case, has led to their death.

SHORT LIST OF DATES

	SHOKI LIST OF DATES
24.07.2022	: Abdul Rajjak Dewan resident of village Kurali, aged about 34 years, was randomly picked up from his home and taken into custody by few police personnel from Baruipur Police Station.
25.07.2022	: (a) Jiyaul Laskar of village Ghutiari, Subhas Pally, aged about 36 years, left home to visit his friend around 4:30pm and since then went missing.
	(b) Abdul Rajjak Dewan was produced before the Court of the Learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate, Baruipur, South 24 Parganas.
	(c) Saidul Munshi, aged about 33 years of Santoshpur, was taken by Maheshtala Police Station from his home with the assurance that he will be released within few hours after interrogation by the officer in charge.
26.07.2022	: Jiyaul Laskar was produced before the Court of Learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate, Baruipur, South 24 Parganas.
27.07.2022	: (a) Rajjak's wife met him in correctional home and found him to be in good health.
28.07.2022	(b) Jiyaul Laskar met his wife in correctional home.: Jiyaul called his wife from jail secretly and asked for money and also gave a Google Pay number to send it.
30.07.2022	send it. : Abdul Rajjak Dewan's family was informed that the condition of his health deteriorated and he was admitted in Baruipur Hospital. Thereafter his family went to hospital and found him dead and his body was covered with marks of bruises.
01.08.2022	: Saidul Munshi was admitted in Baruipur hospital.
02.08.2022	the police that he was admitted in Baruipur Hospital and subsequently he died. (b) Saidul Munshi died.
	(c) The family of Akbar Khan was informed by Bishnupur police station about his death.

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W. P. A. (P) 594 of 2022

Subject matter relating to
Writ in the nature of
Mandamus demanding
appropriate investigation with
regard to death of four under
trial prisoner in Baruipur
Correctional Home

Under GROUP: IX, HEAD: of the classification list

Cause title:

Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) & Anr.

..... Petitioners

-Versus-

The State of West Bengal & Ors

..... Respondents

Advocate-on-Record

Srimoyee Mukherjee

High Court Calcutta

Mobile: 9674254576

Email: srimoyee.mukherjee2015@gmail.com

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W. P. A. (P) 594 of 2022

In the Matter of:

Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) and Anr

......Petitioners

-Versus-

State of West Bengal & Ors

......Respondents

INDEX

[C			
Serial No.	Description of documents	Annexure	Page No.
	List of Dates		(I-II)
	Points of Law		(III-IV)
	Writ Petition along with affidavit		1-22
	Annexure	"P-1"	23-24

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W. P. A. (P) 594 of 2022

In the Matter of:

Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) and Anr

.....Petitioners

-Versus-

State of West Bengal &Ors

......Respondents

LIST OF DATES

24.07.2022 : Abdul Rajjak Dewan was randomly picked

up from his home and taken into custody.

25.07.2022 : (a) Jiyaul Laskar left home to visit his

friend around 4:30pm and since then

went missing.

(b) Abdul Rajjak Dewan was produced

before the Court of the Learned Additional

Chief Judicial Magistrate, Baruipur,

South 24 Parganas.

(c) Saidul Munshi was taken by

Maheshtala Police Station from his home.

26.07.2022 : Jiyaul Laskar was produced before the

Court of Learned Additional Chief Judicial

Magistrate, Baruipur, South 24 Parganas.

(a) Rajjak's wife met him in correctional 27.07.2022 : home. (b) Jiyaul Laskar met his wife in correctional home. 28.07.2022 Jiyaul called his wife from jail secretly and : asked for money. 30.07.2022 Abdul Rajjak Dewan's family went to Baruipur hospital and found him dead and his body was covered with marks of bruises. 01.08.2022 Saidul Munshi was admitted in Baruipur : hospital. (a) The family of Jiyaul Laskar was 02.08.2022 informed by the police that he died in Baruipur Hospital. (b) Saidul Munshi died. (c) Akbar Khan's family was

about his death.

informed by Bishnupur police station

DISTRICT - SOUTH 24 Parganas

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W. P. A. (P) 594 of 2022

In the Matter of:

Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR) and Anr

.....Petitioners

-Versus-

State of West Bengal &Ors

.....Respondents

POINTS OF LAW

- I. Whether the unnatural death of four under trial prisoners belonging to the minority community is an alarming incident which needs judicial intervention by this Hon'ble Court?
- II. Whether these four unnatural deaths of under trial prisoners is highly suspicious with regard to the dates of arrest and the dates of their death?
- III. Whether the custodial violence and unnatural death in correctional home violates of Article 14 and 21 of the Indian Constitution?

- IV. Whether the whimsical detention and torture which eventually causes death of under trial prisoners amounts to an infringement of the guideline issued by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in case of arrest and detention of a person?
- V. Whether or not an independent judicial inquiry committee is required to be formed to ascertain the truth behind the loss of four human lives?
- VI. Whether or not adequate amount of compensation is required to be awarded to the next to kin of the deceased?

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION APPELLATE SIDE

W.P.A(P) No.594 of 2022

In the matter of:
An application under Article
226 of the Constitution of
India.

-And-

In the Matter of:

- 1. Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR), 18 Madan Baral Lane, Kolkata 700012, represented by its General Secretary, Ranjit Sur, Son of Late Sudhir Chandra Sur.
- Ranjit Kumar Sur, Son of
 Late Sudhir Chnadra Sur,
 36/6 Hind Road, New
 Santoshpur, Kolkata 700075

.....Petitioners

-Versus-

- 1. Government of West Bengal service through the Secretary, Home department, Government of West Bengal, Nabanna, 325, Sarat Chatterjee Road, Shibpur, Mandirtala, Howrah -711102;
- 2. West Bengal Correctional
 Services, service through the
 Inspector General of
 Correctional services, Jessop
 Building, 63, Netaji Subhas
 Road, Kolkata, West Bengal
 700001;
- 3. Superintendent,Baruipur Correctional Home,Chakarberia Road, ChakarBar, West Bengal 700145
- 4. Chief Controller of
 Correctional Services,
 Baruipur Correctional Home,
 Chakarberia Road, Chakar
 Bar, West Bengal 700145;
- 5. Superintendent of Police, Baruipur, South 24 paraganas.

- 6. Inspector-in-Charge,
 Baruipur Police Station,
 Baruipur Kulpi Rd,
 Beharapara, Baruipur, West
 Bengal, PIN -700144;
- Inspector-in-Charge,
 Maheshtala Police Station,
 Jagtala, Budge Budge,
 Kolkata, West Bengal, PIN 700140;
- 8. Inspector-in-Charge Bishnupur Police Station, Bara Gagan Gohalia, Bishnupur, West Bengal, PIN – 743503.

.....Respondents

To

The Hon'ble Prakash Shrivastava, Chief Justice and his Companion Justices of the said Hon'ble Court.

The humble petition on behalf of the petitioners abovenamed;

Most Respectfully Sheweth:

1. The petitioner no.1 herein is a non-governmental organization, the oldest active civil and democratic rights organization in the country and is represented by its general secretary, Ranjit Kumar Sur. The petitioner no.1 herein is

working in West Bengal since 1972 and it aims at safe, peaceful, dignified and torture free life of people. The petitioner no. 1 herein champions the cause of protection and promotion of human rights, democratic rights and civil liberties of the people. The petitioner no. 1 herein has espoused causes and interests of the people as well as causes of better and democratic function of public administration and affairs of the state with honesty and sincerity. The petitioner no. 1 herein has brought various issues of public interest to the notice of this Hon'ble Court especially where the state has failed and/or neglected to discharge its Constitutional and legal obligation to protect and secure the interest of its citizens.

- 2. The petitioner no. 2 herein is presently aged about 67 years, by profession a retired bank employee, and is presently residing at the address given in the cause title. He is a law-abiding citizen of India devoid of criminal antecedents, a public spirited individual and a known Human Rights Activist who also contributed writings in various newspaper and journals with regard to human rights issues. He also happens to be the General Secretary of petitioner no. I herein.
- 3. That the petitioners herein are constrained to invoke the writ jurisdiction of this Hon'ble Court in public interest, inter alia, seeking measures to take cognizance of and devise method of rudiment for investigation pertaining to mysterious and unnatural death of four under trial prisoners while being in custody which cannot be considered as mere coincidence.

- That on 24.07.2022, one Abdul Rajjak Dewan resident of 4. village Kurali, aged about 34 years, was randomly picked up from his home and taken into custody by few police personnel from Baruipur Police Station. On being asked, the police never said anything clearly or at all. Abdul, who was into poultry business in Bihar, came to his home from Bihar for the occasion of Eid, was produced before the Court of Learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate, Baruipur, South 24 Parganas on 25.07.2022 and he was given 14 days judicial custody for offence under sections 399/402 of the Indian Penal Code 1860. His wife visited him in correctional home on 27.07.2022 and he was perfectly fine at that point of time. On 30.07.2022, his family was informed that the condition of his health deteriorated and he was admitted to Baruipur Hospital. Thereafter his family went to the hospital and found him dead and his body was covered with marks of sore and bruises. The hospital informed that he died the night before and on being asked the reason of death, the police misbehaved with the family members and intimidated them.
- 5. On 25.07.2022, Jiyaul Laskar of village Ghutiari, Subhas Pally aged about 36 years, left home to visit his friend around 4:30pm and since then went missing. Next day his wife went to Police Station and after much harassment came to know that her husband was arrested along with two others and they were severely assaulted while taking into custody. On 26.07.2022 he was produced before the Court of learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate Baruipur, South 24 Parganas and he was already limping at that time as he was beaten up. Thereafter he

was remanded to judicial custody for offence under sections 399/402 of the Indian Penal Code 1860. On 27.07.2022, his wife visited him in correctional home and he informed her that he was fine. Further on 28.07.2022, Jiyaul called his wife secretly from the correctional home and instructed her to send him money through google pay in a particular number and his wife followed his instruction. Since then, there was no contact with Jiyaul and finally on 02.08.2022, his family was informed by the police that he suddenly became sick and was admitted in Baruipur Hospital and subsequently he died. Thereafter his family went to the hospital but at first, they were refused access to the body and after much altercation and harassment they were permitted to see the body. His body was also full of multiple bruises.

It is pertinent to mention here that the other two co accused who were granted bail informed that Jiyaul was taken to hospital and there he was terribly tortured for 2 days continuously. He was beaten with wooden sticks while his hands tied with bed and boiling hot water was also poured in his body. Subsequently he died. The two co-accused were regularly threatened with dire consequences by the police each time they visited Baruipur Police Station for attendance. It is also pertinent to mention herein that the wife of the deceased lodged a complaint before the Learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate Baruipur, South 24 Parganas that her husband was tortured and beaten up to death by the police while in custody and the Court ordered to visually record the whole process of inquest in the presence of the Learned Magistrate and at least two persons from the family

members but nothing like this happened at all. The family members were misguided throughout the procedure and according to them nothing like that happened in reality as they were purposely harassed and they were never permitted to be present during the said procedure.

On 25.07.2022, Saidul Munshi, aged about 33 years of 6. Santoshpur was taken by Maheshtala Police Station from his home with the assurance to be released within few hours after interrogation by the inspector in charge. But he never returned and next day his wife was harassed by the police in every possible way firstly in Jinjira Bazar police station and then at Maheshatala police station and finally after bribing them she was allowed to meet her husband. Saidul told that he was brutally beaten for the whole night. On being asked the police informed that a 'Bhojali' was recovered from him but his family members claim that he was taken from home while having dinner and nothing was under his possession at that time. Saidul was pounded in front of his wife and was taken to Vidyasagar Hospital. Thereafter he was taken to Court of Learned Additional Chief Judicial magistrate and on the way, he was mercilessly kicked by the police. His wife was informed that he was granted judicial custody and that was the last time his family saw him. On 02.08.2022, Saidul's family was informed that he was admitted to hospital the day before. After reaching to the hospital his family discovered him lying naked on urine covered with bruises on whole body but he was alive at that time without any treatment. The doctor suggested to admit him in ICU due to his critical condition but the police denied. They also

requested to admit him in private hospital but nothing happened and he subsequently died without treatment.

- 7. The last victim of this atrocious activity by police also belonged to the minority community. Akbar Khan, aged about 40 years went missing for 10-12 days. His family was never informed about his arrest. On 02.08.2022, his family was informed by Bishnupur police station about his death and his family also noticed that his body was covered with marks of bruises indicating the cruelty he suffered for days which caused his death.
- 8. Pursuant to the abovementioned facts, a terrible picture is displayed with regard to the condition of the correctional home in West Bengal. Four persons arrested by the police from different police station under similar charges under sections 399/402 of the Indian Penal Code 1860 within jurisdiction of Baruipur Sub Division and all of them died between 30.07.2022 to 02.08.2022 while in custody. Nothing was informed to their respective families about their health, the episode of admitting them to hospital and in some cases their family members never knew that they were arrested. The family members have not been issued a memo of arrest nor was the next of kin informed as is required to be done in accordance with law.
- 9. The petitioners state that the admitted fact is that the deceased persons were arrested and they were produced before the court of Learned Additional Chief Judicial Magistrate, Baruipur, South 24 Parganas, thus the burden is on the respondents to explain how the four person sustained injuries

all over their bodies which caused their death. Therefore, unless a cogent and rational explanation is given by the respondents which is coherent with their innocence, the obvious conjecture is that the fatal injuries were inflicted upon these persons while in custody resulting in their death, for which the respondent authorities ought to be made answerable and to be held accountable.

- The petitioners state that it is really unfortunate to witness 10. custodial violence and unnatural deaths in a democracy but also this vibrant democracy permits to debate and discuss these issues with rational arguments. However, any dialectic conclusion cannot be achieved unless persons in authority hear the voices of the victims or the silence of the dead and the helpless condition of these families who suffer this everlasting loss and trauma induced by the police authority. There must be a greater degree of sensitivity among those in authority with regard to persons in custody. According to Article 21 of the Constitution, the dignity of the individual in custody is not a plaything for those in authority.
- 11. The petitioners submit that the arbitrary detention and subsequently infliction of third-degree torture violates personal modesty and dignity of under trial prisoners. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, in the landmark judgment of Smt Nilabati Behera @ Lalit Behera Vs. The State of Orissa 1993 Supreme Court Cases (vol 2) page 746, observed that ".... This Court has time and again emphasized the importance of Article 21of the Constitution and the right to a life of dignity. There must be a

genuine desire to ensure that the guarantee to a life of dignity is provided to the extent possible even in prisons, otherwise Article 21 of the Constitution will remain a dead letter. It must be appreciated by the State that the common person does not violate the law for no reason at all. It is circumstances that lead to a situation where there is a violation of law. On many occasions, such a violation may be of a trivial nature or may be a one-time aberration and, in such circumstances, the offender has to be treated with some degree of humanity. At least in such cases, retribution and deterrence cannot be an answer to the offence and the offender. Unless the State changes this mindset and takes steps to give meaning to life and liberty of every prisoner, prison reforms can never be effective or long lasting..."

- 12. The petitioners submit that the ambiguity regarding the mysterious death of these under trial prisoners also made their families victim. They were vexed, insulted, extorted and even given indecent proposals considering their helplessness and destitute conditions. These four persons who belonged to the minority community, they were the earning members of the family and have children who are in dire straits now.
- 13. Further, the International Committee for Red Cross (ICRC) gave guidelines on investigating death in custody. According to the guideline, it is the duty of the State to ensure, respect and protect the life of persons within jurisdiction including persons in custody and no one may be deprived of right to life whimsically. It is mentioned in the guideline that in case of death of a person in prison, thorough investigation should

proceed in regard to facts related to such death, the manner, place and time of death and also the involvement of all those implicated in the death. According to the ICRC, 'death' is the irreversible cessation of all vital functions, including brain activity. Death is 'natural' when it is caused solely by disease and/or the aging process. It is 'unnatural' when its causes are external, such as intentional injury (homicide, suicide), negligence or unintentional injury (death by accident).

- 14. The **ICRC** has categorically mentioned about procedures to be followed in case of custodial death in a framework which covers every procedure that need to be proceed by the authorities. It has mentioned that investigation of custodial death must be concluded considering the legal aspect and the medical and forensic aspect. Investigation must be done with regard to proper maintenance of death scene including management of the death scene and body. Most importantly, there is also a clear and vivid procedure for conducting the Post Mortem examination. The Post Mortem examination is to determine and record the identity of the deceased, the estimated time of death and most importantly the cause of death which in this instant case is not clearly mentioned. The Post Mortem report also helps to determine the manner of death whether natural, suicidal, accidental, homicidal or unnatural followed by the sequence of event that may have led to the death.
- 15. The petitioners submit that this horrible incident which ultimately caused death of 4 persons in custody at Baruipur Correctional Home requires a just, fair and impartial

investigation. Even the Post Mortem report is not clear. The opinion of the Medical Officer regarding the cause of death is kept pending. According to the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC), certain instructions need to be followed while sending post-mortem reports in cases of custodial death. In order to streamline the procedure, the NHRC issued certain instructions and among them were the following:

- A. The post-mortem report along with the videography and the magisterial enquiry report must be sent to the NHRC within two months of the incident.
- B. The post-mortem report should be sent in the proforma attached to the letter dated 27th March, 1997.
- C. The magisterial enquiry into a custodial death should be completed as soon as possible but within a period of two months.

(RE: Inhuman Condition 1382 prisons vs. State of Assam and ors in connection with Writ Petition (Civil) Nos. 406 of 2013.)

Photocopies of the post mortem reports of the deceased persons namely Saidul Munshi and Akbar Khan @ Khokan are annexed hereto and collectively marked "P-1".

Your petitioners crave leave to refer to the post mortem reports of Abdul Laskar Dewan and Jiyaul Laskar at the time of hearing, if necessary.

- 16. The petitioner submits that the Hon'ble Apex Court framed a guideline in the oft quoted judgment of D.K Basu vs. State of West Bengal (as reported in 1997 Supreme Court Cases (criminal) page 92), which need to be followed while arresting a person. In the said guideline it was mentioned that the arrestee should be subjected to medical examination by the trained doctor every 48 hours during his detention in custody by a doctor on the panel of approved doctors appointed by Director, Health Services of the concerned State or Union Territory, Director, Health Services should prepare such a panel for all Tehsils and Districts as well. Considering the abovementioned guideline, the records of post arrest medical report of the deceased need to be produced before this Hon'ble Court for a just adjudication of the instant matter.
- 17. The petitioner submits that in case of one of the deceased, Akbar Khan, who went missing and his family members were completely unaware of his whereabouts and the aforesaid guideline (D.K. Basu) was never followed while arresting him. His family members were only informed after his death. As per the guideline, a person who is detained is entitled to have at least one person known to him, informed about his arrest and preparation of the memo of arrest is mandatory.
- 18. The petitioner also submits that Rule 71 of Nelson Mandela Rules is very pertinent in the instant petition. The Rule conveys that in case of any custodial death, disappearance or serious injury shall be reported without delay to a judicial or other competent authority that is independent of the prison

administration. But the steps taken by the correctional home authority is under question. Deputations were given by the petitioner to the Inspector General, Correctional Home on and to the Hon'ble Minister of West Bengal in charge of Correctional Homes on 10.08.2022 but till date no proper information was received from their part.

The Petitioner submits that the death of four persons in 19. custody cannot be mere coincidence. The most suspicious part of the whole incident is that four persons, all belonging to the minority community, aged between 30-40 years, were taken into custody in connection with same offence under section 399/402 of the Indian Penal Code 1860 in four separate cases and all of them died between 30.07.2022 to 02.08.2022. Their family members were never informed about any kind of illness or ill health of the said deceased persons. The most disturbing and alarming fact that Akbar Khan who is one of the deceased, his family received the news of his death and they had no prior knowledge that he was arrested. Further, all the family members witnessed bruises and clear mark of assault all over their bodies. All these were categorically mentioned in the deputation submitted by the petitioner.

Your petitioners crave leave to refer to such deputations at the time of hearing, if necessary.

20. The petitioner submits that 4 unnatural deaths in within a short span of time in the same jurisdiction cannot be an undiluted coincident. It is a very doubtful that three or four separate group of miscreants consisting of all different

individual, planned dacoity under same sub division, during the same period of time. The whole process was draped and contrived by the police personnel for some unknown grudge towards the deceased. Therefore, a judicial enquiry is necessary to ascertain the truth and to bring the perpetrators to justice.

- 21. The petitioner submits that the unnatural death of for under trial prisoners in same correctional home is very much alarming and shocking. It is not within the knowledge of the petitioners whether till date, any judicial inquiry has been initiated. From the post mortem reports of the deceased, it transpires that in each incident an unnatural death case was initiated in accordance with law. In the case of Abdul Raja Dewan, it is U.D. case no. 175/22 dated 30.07.2022. In the case of Jiyaul Laskar it is U.D. Case no. 180/22 dated 02.08.22. In the case of Saidul Munshi it is U.D. Case no. 181/22 dated 03.08.22. In the case of Khokan Khan @ Akbar it is U.D. Case no. 178/22 dated 01.08.22. It is therefore prayed, that the details of the said case records be called for to determine the extent and nature of such inquiry.
- 22. The Hon'ble Supreme Court opined in the landmark judgment of Smt Nilabati Behera @ Lalit Behera Vs. The State of Orissa (supra) that ".... a claim in public law for compensation' for contravention of human rights and fundamental freedoms, the protection of which is guaranteed in the Constitution, is an acknowledged remedy for enforcement and protection of such rights, and such a claim based on strict liability made by resorting to a constitutional remedy provided for the enforcement

of a fundamental right is 'distinct from, and in addition to, the remedy in private law for damages for the tort' resulting from the contravention of the fundamental right. The defense of sovereign immunity being inapplicable, and alien to the concept of guarantee of fundamental rights, there can be no question of such a defense being available in the constitutional remedy. It is this principle which justifies award of monetary compensation for contravention of fundamental rights guaranteed by the Constitution, when that is the only practicable mode of redress available for the contravention made by the State or its servants in the purported exercise of their powers, and enforcement of the fundamental right is claimed by resort to the remedy in public law under the Constitution by recourse to Articles 32 and 226 of the Constitution ..."

23. Being aggrieved by and/or being dissatisfied with the unnatural deaths of four undertrial prisoners and the lack of transparency regarding the cause of such deaths, the petitioners beg to move the instant application in public interest inter alia on the following amongst other –

GROUNDS

- I. For that the right to life under article 21 of the constitution of India is an unalienable right and is one of the most important fundamental rights of citizens of India.
- II. For that even a suspect or a convict cannot be deprived of their right to life without the due process of law and any contravention thereof by the functionaries of the State ought to be dealt with strictly by the constitutional court.

- III. For that the violation of constitutional rights of the citizens of India is to be looked into by the constitutional court and take necessary steps to ensure protection of the same.
- IV. For that the non-compliance of the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court regarding the procedure of arrest and regarding prevention of any custodial violence by the executive strikes at the very root of a democratic set up.
- V. For that this Hon'ble Court has time and again upheld the constitution and the rights of its citizens and has strictly dealt with any violation thereof.
- VI. For that the family members of the deceased are from a economically backward class as well as from the religious minority community and they do not have the means to approach this court for a remedy.
- VII. For that it is imperative to conduct an independent judicial enquiry into the unnatural deaths to ascertain the cause behind such death and to bring the perpetrator justice.
- 24. The petitioners crave leave to take such other or further grounds that may be available to the Petitioners at the time of hearing of the instant case.
- 25. The petitioners state that the cause of action is within the aforesaid jurisdiction of this Hon'ble Court.
- 26. The petitioners have a prima facie case as the aforesaid incident of unnatural death strikes at the very ethos of the

Constitution of India and is violative of the Right to Equality and Right to Life guaranteed under Articles 14 and 21 of the Constitution of India respectively.

- 27. The petitioners state that no application has been filed earlier or at all before this Hon'ble Court or any Court of Law on the self-same cause of action and seeking the same relief by the petitioners.
- 28. The petitioners state that there is no alternate or efficacious remedy is available to the petitioners than to approach this Hon'ble Court and the relief prayed for herein are adequate relief.
- 29. The instant application has been filed for the interest of the public, especially the under-trial prisoners and the families who suffered due to custodial death of their close ones in the State of West Bengal and the petitioners have no private interest involved in the instant matter.
- 30. The instant petition is made bona fide and for the ends of justice.

In the circumstances as narrated hereinabove, it is most respectfully prayed that Your Lordships may graciously be pleased to passed the following amongst other orders:

- (i) That a writ be issued (a) in the nature of Mandamus thereby directing the police authorities to register a case under appropriate provisions of the Indian Penal Code, 1860 and to forthwith hand over the investigation to the Central Bureau of Investigation for an independent inquiry into the cause of death of the undertrial prisoners;
- (a) (ii) Alternatively, a direction be passed thereby directing the constitution of a committee headed by a Hon'ble retired Judge of this Hon'ble Court to inquire into the death of four under trial prisoners as aforesaid and such inquiry must be proceeded with under the supervision of this Hon'ble Court;
- (b) That a writ be issued in the nature of Certiorari thereby directing the Respondent Authorities to

forthwith produce all documents relating to aforesaid incident, including documents relating to memo of arrests, post arrest medical examination reports, the post mortem reports, the records relating to the unnatural death cases, records relating to internal inquiry, if any, before this Hon'ble Court for just and proper adjudication;

- (c) That a writ be issued in the nature of Mandamus thereby directing the Respondent Authorities to submit a report to show cause as to why arrest protocol as directed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were not followed while arresting the deceased persons without any notice to the family;
- (d) That a writ be issued in the nature of Mandamus thereby directing the State

Government to take necessary steps to compensate the family of the deceased with adequate compensations;

- (e) Rule Nisi in terms of prayers (a) to (d)
- (f) Costs
- (g) Such other order and/or orders as your Lordships may deem fit and proper.

And for this act of kindness, your petitioner as in duty bound shall ever pray.

AFFIDAVIT

- I, Ranjit Kumar Sur, son of Late Sudhir Chandra Sur, aged about 67 years, by faith- Hindu, by occupation: retired from service, resident of 36/6 Hind Road, New Santoshpur, Kolkata 700075, do hereby solemnly affirm and say as follows:-
- 1. I am the petitioner no. 2 and have been duly authorized to swear and affirm this affidavit for and on behalf of petitioner no. las well as for self.
- 2. I am well conversant with the facts and circumstances of the instant case and am competent to affirm thereto.
- 3. That the statements contained in paragraphs 4 to 7, 12 of the petition are true to the best of my knowledge and belief, those contained in paragraph nos. 8, 9, 15, 19, 21 are matters of record which I duly verified and verily believe to be true and rest are my respectful humble submissions before this Hon'ble Court.

Prepared in my office

SDF S. Mikhejer

Advocate.

Identified by me,

Sdf Romjit Kunner Sur.

Enl.No.

I certify that all annexure are legible

Set S. Murchistice
Advocate

Advocate

Solemnly affirmed before me on this the 27 day of November, 2022.

Notary Public

io. 440/ Beruipur P.S.,

POST - MORTEM REPORT -23 -

(P.R.B. Form No. 55 -Vida Rule 284) **ORIGINAL**

Annexure

STATION: KOLKATA POLICE MORGUE DATE :- D3RB DAY OF AUGUST, 2022

P.M. Na. 438/2822, DATE: 83/88/2022

	wnence	Nome of constable		Date and hour	case no. 181/22, of	dated #3/08/2022,	T
Name, sex, ago, caste	brought- village and Thana	by whem brought and nemes of relatives accompanying	Dead body received	Papers received	Examination	Information furnished by Police addul Munshi, resident of Santoshpur. azar Para, P.S. Maheshtala, District: outh 24 Parganas, was ao under -trial risoner af Baruipur Central correctional Home in c/w Maheshtala S. case na. 381/22 since 26/07/2022. e was admitted at Baruipur Sub (ii) Reshn (iii) Reshn	By whom identified before the Medical Officer
SAIB UL MUNSHI S/o Siddik Munshi, Male, Aged 33 years, Muslim.	Barulpur PS,	C/214 Joydeb Kaya! af flaraipur P.S., and Reshma Bihi, wife of the deceased	06:00PM, 06:05PM, 03/08/2022		Started at 07:0SPM, 03/08/2012, Completed at 09:3SPM, 03/0B/2822	Saidul Munshi, residont of Santoshpur. Bazar Para, P.S. Maheshtala, District: South 24 Parganas, was ao under -trial prisoner af Baruipur Central Correctional Home in c/w Maheshtala P.S. case na. 381/22 since 26/07/2022. He was admitted at Baruipur Sub 8ivisional Hospital on D1/8B/2022. He expired there on 03/0B/2022 at 04:00AM.	(i) Dipendu Pal, PSI of Barulpur P.S. (ii) Surai Kymar Chowdhury, warder of Barulpur Central Correction Home: (iii) Reshma Bibi, wife of tho deceased; (iv) Salma Bibi, sister of the deceased.

en na disease ar injury is found write " Healthy 2. Weunds-position, size, character. 3. Bruises-position, size and nature.

1. Condition of Subject-stout. emaciated decemposed, etc. Body length 163cm, one thin-built dead hody of a male subject having dark complexian; scalp hair ficm lang, black in colour; beard and moustache 1.5cm long, both black in calour. Wearing apparels (i) one white calored dhoti, (ii) ane adult diaper. Rigar mortic is present all over the body. Postmartem staining is present on dependent parts of the back except aver pressure points with contact flattening. Multiple old healed scar marks af uarying lengths are present over flexor surfaces of right forearm invelving an area of 18cm X 6.Scm and left forearm invelving an area of 16.5 X 6.5cm. Evidence af hyperpigmentation measuring 18cm X 7.5cm noted over an area involving right buttack, intragivteal cleft and a portion of left

4. Marks of ligature on neck, dissection, etc. Injuries: (1) One abrasion, 8.8cm X 0.5cm, placed aver ulnar barder of left wrist joint. (2) Multiple abrasions, S in number, sizes varying fram 0.5cm X D.5cm to 1cm X 0.8cm, involving an acea of 6cm X 4cm placed over darsal aspect of left wrist joint (3) One abrasion, 2.5cm X 1cm, placed over lateral aspect of left arm 18cm distal from Up af left acromion process. (4) One abrasion, 8.2cm X 8.2cm, placed over lower part of medial barder af right arm aspect of left arm 18cm distal from tip af left acromion process. (4) One abrasion, 8.2cm x 8.2cm, placed over lower part of medial harder af right arm 2cm praximal to right medial epicondyle. (5) One abrasion, 8.5cm x 0.5cm, placed over lower part af medial barder af right arm 1.5cm proximal to right indicated epicondyle. (6) Dae abrasion, 0.8cm x 8.5cm, placed over right medial epicondyle. (7) One abrasion, 2.5cm x 8.5cm, placed aver lateral horder of epicondyle. (9) One abrasion, 2cm x 0.5cm, placed over ulnar bordec af right forearm, 5cm distal to right medial epicondyle. (9) One abrasion, 2cm x 0.5cm, placed aver ulnar border ef right facearm, 4cm preximal to lower end af right ulna. (10) One abrasion, 0.8cm x 0.2cm, placed over medial aspect af right knee jaint. (11) One abrasion, 0.8cm x 0.2cm, placed over medial aspect of right knee jaint. (11) One abrasion, 0.8cm x 0.2cm, placed over arrying from 0.1cm x 0.1cm to 0.7cm x 0.2cm, involving an area af 3cm x 1.5cm, placed aver anterior aspect of right ankle joint. (13) One abrasian, 0.5cm x 0.5cm, placed over anterior aspect of left foot, 2.5cm distal to left lateral malleolus. (15) One abrasian, 0.5cm x 0.5cm, placed over abrasian, 0.5cm x 0.5cm above left heet. (16) One (13) the abrasian, 0.5cm x 0.5cm, placed over anteriar aspect of left anxie jains (14) une abrasian, 2.5cm x 0.2cm, placed aver lateral aspect of left foot, 2.5cm distal to left lateral malleolus. (15) One abrasian, 0.5cm X 0.5cm, placed over pasterior aspect af left anxie joint, 5.5cm above left heel. (16) One abrasian, 0.5cm X 8.5cm, placed aver medial surface af left legt, 6.5cm distal to left floigt head. (17) 8 ne linear abrasian of 4cm length, placed obliquely aver uppar part of left posterior chest wall with its upper end 2.5cm left to pasterior midline and 13cm distal to external accipital pratuberance. (18) One abrasion, 18cm x 1.5cm, placed auer left pasteriar chest wall with its upper end 6.5cm left to posterior midline and 1.2cm abave lower end of left scapula. (19) One abrasian, 2.5cm x 0.5cm, placed over left posterior and the lawer and t.2cm left to posterior midline and 16.5cm below lower end of left scapula. lawer and t.2cm left to posterior midline and 16.5cm below lower end of left scapula. (19) One abrasian, 2.5cm X D.5cm, placed over left posterior abdominal wall with its lawer end 10cm vertically above left iliac crest. (20) One abrasian, Bcm X B.Bcm, placed over right posterior chest wall with its upper and 11cm right to posteriar midline and 9cm distal to the of right access. (21) One linear xbrasion of 6.5cm length, placed obliquely over right posteriar abdaminal wall with its upper end 5cm right to pasteriar midline and 21.5cm distal to lower end of right scapula. (22) one lacerated would measuring 3cm X D.5cm X subcutaneous tissue, placed abliquely over right pasterior abdaminal wall aimost overlying posterior portion of iliac crest with its upper end 2.5cm right to posterior midline. (23) One abrasian, 4cm X D.5cm, placed over lateral aspect of right buttock with its upper end 11cm violated aspect and 11cm violate a pasteriar midline. On discaption (24) Expressions of blood measuring 9cm X 3cm diffused over ctes with its upper end a.5cm right to posterior midline. (43) One abrasian, acm x u.5cm, piaced over lateral aspect or right flac crest and 11cm right to pasteriar midline. On dissection: (24) Extravasation of blood measuring 9cm X 3cm, diffused over pasterior aspect af left forearm, 2.5cm distal to left lateral epicondyle. (25) Extravasation of blood measuring 6.5cm X 4cm, diffused over posterior part of frantal region af scalp. (26) Sub-araelmoid haemarrhage measuring 6.5cm X 3cm, over right eccipital lobe. All the injuries are ante-mortem, show evidence af vitai reaction. Abrasiens are cavered with reddish-brown coloured scab. Extravasation of blood are reddish-blue in calour. Lacerated wound has irregular margin with extravasated blood in and around. Na other external or internal injury could have been detected on charaugh, precise and

Scalp - Skuil and Vartebrae. Scalp : as noted,					2. Membrane. 3. Grain and Spl		al Cord	· (The sp	inal canal nee	d not be exami	ned unless ar		
Skuli & vertebrae : Intact,					Pale, Br		Brain:	ladication of disease of injury exists, ain: Pale & aedematous, Wt: 12B6gms,					
Cartilage	Cartilage 2. Pieurae 3. Laryna and Trachea.				Right Lung	L	Spinal cerd : Intact. eft Lung Pericardium			1 Heart Versale			
Walls: ssineted, thickened and alsa found adhered to the adjoining thacacic cage at places on right aide.		Muco alsa Pale, to the Hyaid acte cartil on	Mucous membrane : Pale, Hyaid bone & thyroid B		Wt. of right lung : 482 Wt. of left lung: 379 both lungs are pale with evidences it places; On sectioning, there is en fluid mixed with pu		gms. of censalidations cudation of frothy	Pale.		Wt.: 190gms, it shows Grade I atherama at the reot of ascending aarta.		Grade I athernma at otaces.	
1. Walls	Walls 2. Peritoneum 3. Mouth, Pherynx and Esophagus				4. Stomach and its contents			s.s	Small Intestine and its 6. Large Intestine and				
As noted.	Pale,		embrane ; ale			orea mucous Iows sub-muc	60gms; Stomach containing 100us mixed fluid. Mucous b-mucosal haemorrhages at			Both mucous membrane : Pale, Cantaining gas and faeces.			
7. Liver 8. Spicen		pleen		9. Kidnays		18. Bladder							
Pale Healthy Wt: 844gms. Wt: 46gms.			Bath kidneys pale. Wt of right kidney: 83ams		Mi	ucous membrane : Pale,		11.1	11. Drgans of generation, external and intern				
1. Injury			Wt. of right kidney: 90gms 2. Disease or defermity		Cavity : Empty.			Healthy.					
As noted sterials preserved : (1) Whole of the stomach with its con			NIL NIL		3. Fracture Nil			4. Dislocation					
											1		

kidneys : preserved in saturated selution of cammon salt with control, (5) 10ml of blood without preservative, (6) hair. (7) nail cutting and scrapping : for chemical analysis and (8) Section of both lungs in 10 % formal saline for histo-pathological examination. All duly packed, sealed, signed and handed over to police personnel for anward transmission. The whole past-mortem was done under video phetography and the cassette was duly packed, sealed, labeled, signed and handed aver to escorting palice persannel.

DPINION OF THE MEDICAL OFFICER AS TO THE CAUSE OF DEATH

: case of wounds note whether there is any indication of the wounds being hamicidal, suicidal or atherwise.

is to the cause of death is kept pending till the receipt of chemical and histopathological examination reports.

geon of O Kausik Tudas 03/8/22

Assti. Profe**zio** epti of Ferencie & Septi of Forencia State Medicine State Medigine

Demonstrator on of Parende State Medicine مناخي آي



POSTMORTEM REPORT

(P.R.B. Form No. 55 - Vide Rule 284)

-24 -

Station: Kolkata Police Morgue

DRIGINAL DB No. 441/Baruipur PS: Reference: Baruipur PS GBE No 68/22 dated 02:08:2022 & UD Case No.178/22 dated 01:08:2022 & Sec E1 6DE No. 236 dated 03:08:1022 Date: 03rd August, 2022 Name of the Constable 4ate and hour of Whence brought - village Name, Sex, Age & Caste by whom krought and information furnished by & Thans Dead Body Paper By whom identified before to names of raistives PM Police Received Medical Officer Recaived accompanying Examination KHOKON KHAN @ C/214 Jaydeb Kayal of Beru lpus AKRAD Shubamay Ghosh , PSt of Barulpur P.S. 06-20 PM 05-25 PM instral Correctional Morne since 6.07.2022, On 01.08.2022, the sa uddenly leg & in the correctional and was shifted to Baruspur Subdis copital where he was declared by K.S & Anjwara Bibl, W/O Khoko 06-15 PM or MALE, about 48 years. Barulpur P.5 Sural Kumer Chowchury, Warder of Khen and Samina Bibi, Sister of On OD 03.08.2022 Berulpur Central Correctional Hon MUSUM KRekon Than x3.08.2012 03.08.2022 erulpur and Anjuera XIbi, W/O Xhokon 01.06.2022 at \$4.45 hour N.B. - Observed the state of all the organs and when disease or injury is found write "Healthy" 1. Condition of the subjectstout. 2. Wounds - Position, size, character emaclated, decomposed etc. 4. - Marks of lighture on neck 3. 4ruises - Position, size and nature dissection etc. Deed body of a male subject, length-66 inches, Rigor Montis-present ther the lawer lanks only (7 good chamber), eyes closed, conjuctive, congested, commentery, pupils-fixed and distred equally an either sides, Spid-Hair - 3", mixed grey and black in colour, Moustache "Evidence of post mortern staining noted over whole of the back of tha body except the pressure points, Evidence of post mortern peeling of sidn noted over both the buttocks. One old sear mark 2" X e.2" noted over the left lateral aspect of enterior needs wall 6.4" below the top of estile.

INJURIES: 1. Abrasion 2.5" X 0.3" over the despect-of-state aspect of left arm 3" district to the tip of shoulder. 2. Multiple small ebrasions(tex in number) over an area of over the potential appeal of left allow, the largest measuring 1.5° X 2" and the smallest measuring 0.6" X 0.3". 1. Graze abrasion measuring 2." X 0.5° over the pesterior aspect of left allow, the largest measuring 1.5° X 2" and the smallest measuring 0.6" X 0.3". 1. Graze abrasion measuring 2" X 0.5° over the pesterior aspect of left forearm 5.5° oldstall to that (lot of olderanon process. 4. Abrasion 1" X X.5" over induction of middle finger of left hand, 5. Abrasion 3.5" X 3.5° over the lateral espect of left forearm 5.5° over the lateral espect of left hand, 5. Abrasion 3.5" X 3.5° over the lateral espect of left hand, 5. Abrasion 3.5" X 3.5° over the lateral espect of left hand, 5. Abrasion 3.5" X 3.5° over the lateral malleolut. 0.5", mixed grey and black in co rey and black in colour , Beard - 0.4"; mixed grey and in Waaring Apparets - till except one blue Rall oant w of left forearm S.S" data! to this till of olectanon process. 4. Abrasion 1" X.3" over the relutance or minute, impair of minutes of left leg 0.2" above the lateral amplicolut. Is the left heel. 7. Xbrasion LS" X.4" over lateral aspect of left leg 0.2" above the lateral malleolut. 8. Abrasion 1" X.2" over the spectrol aspect of left leg at the level of medial malleolut. 10. Abrasion 3" X.1" over the smarror aspect of left leg 4.5" proximal to the left heel. 9. Abrasion 3" X.1" over the smarror respect of left leg 4.5" proximal to the left shade joint with one lecerative thought 1" S.0.3" X subcutaneous tissue over the proximal end of the injuny. 11. Graze special on 3" X.2" over the posterior aspect of right elbow joint, the legist in the legist X.5" X.5." and smallest 0.2" X.0." A shade 0.5" X.0." over the medial approximate aspect of left leg 4.5" proximal to the to of olectanon process. 12. Multiplo small abrasions over an area 43.5" X.1.5" in the injuny. 11. Graze abrasion 2.5" X.0." X.0." Over the medial approximate of right than 0.5" X.0." over the medial approximate of legist leg 1.5" below the kneed lass spine. 15. Abrasion 0.5" X.0." over the medial aspect of the right later of legist spine. 17. Ephsalon 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect as right legists below the kneed lass spine. 15. Abrasion 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of the right spine 3.5" is special or 0.5" X.0." over the antero-sterial aspect as right legists below the kneed aspect of the right spine 3.5" aspect of the spine of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of right legists below the kneed aspect of the right spine 3.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect as right legists below the kneed aspect of 1.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of 1.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of 1.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of 1.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of 1.5" aspect of 0.5" X.0." over the metro-sterial aspect of 1.5" aspect rea of elastic and chains in both pockets. A tear was present in ractic area to exact, and creams in open potterts. A rear was present in the right potters area. Some steins files that of stool was present in the tiner aspect of the park. One tettoe mach with black his. "Righ" was resent over the leseral aspect of right erm. 7" below the right up of ulder. Evidence of bluish disculo aration noted in the finger eds. Presence of small immeture maggots noted in the oral wity, in the ears and few areas of scalp." Cranium and spinal canal 1. - Scaip - Skuli and Vertebrae 3. - Brein and spinal cord - [The spinal canal need not be 2. - Membranes exemined unless any indication of disease or injury exists] Scalp- As noted. Skuli- intact. Congested Brain-Congested. Weight of brain-1285 gm. Vertebra-Intact. 1. - Walls, ribs and Z. - Pieura 3. - Larynx and traches cartilages Rt. Lung Lt. Lung Pericardium Heart Vessels Wt of Rt lung- 848 gm. Congested, Wt of left lune Mucous membrane of Walls- As noted: Ribs SBS gm and as noted, on larynx and tracheadissection, there is: Congested. & cartilages- As noted congested . Hyold bone Healthy, Weight - 226 Congested. exudation of blood mixed Healthy. & 1hyxoid cartilage-RM. with froth. Intact 1. - Walis 3. - Mouth, Pharynx and 2. - Paritoneum 5. - Small intestine and its 4. - Stomach end its contents 6. - Lerge intestine and its Oesophagus contents contents Muceus membrane congested with evidences Mucus membrane . As noted. of submucosei haemorrhege et places. Wt of Congested Mucous membrane-congested. stomach with contents 305 gm. Compins 105 congested. Contains gas and faecal matter. gm of mucus mixed yellow colour fluid. 2. « Liver 8. - Spieen 9. Kidnevs 10. - Cladder 11. - Organs of generations, externel and internal Healthy. Both kidneys congested. Wt Healthy, Wt- 135 gm. Mucous membrane congested. of Xight Iddney -105 gm, Wt ₩t- 1076 gm. Healthy Cavity empty. of Left iddney - 135 gm. Bones 1. - Injury 2. Oisoase and deformity 3. - Fracture 4. - Bisiocation As noted. As noted. Nii. *20. Lacerated wound 1.5° X p.6" X subcutaneous tissue noted over the lateral aspect of right knee joint area 3" below the upper and of patella. 21. Lacerated wound 0.5" X Q.2" X subcutan s upper and of right patells. 22. Lacerated wound 3.5° X 0.4" X subcutaneous tasses noted over the anterior aspect of right tible 3.6" below the upper end of patells, 23. Abrasion 0.5" X 0.2" over the anterior of right tible 2.6" below the wous tissue noted over the anterior aspect aspact of the right obja X.5" below the upper and of right patella. 24. Multiple small ebrasions (total 5) over an area of 9" X X.8" over antero-madial aspect of right leg 3.3" above right medial malkeolus, the largest being 0.4" X 0.2" over The smallest 0.2" x 8.1" in dimensions. 25. Altrasion 2,7" x 1.5" over enserior aspect of lower end of right leg at the level of ends joint. 26. Multiple small obrasions (total 8) over an area of e" x 3" in the posterior aspect of lower part of log 3" above the right heal, the largest 2.5" X 8.6" and smallest 0.3" x 0.2" in dimensions. 22. Greze abrasion 3" x 0.8" over the right scapular region 5" right to the midNas and 4" below the tip of right shoulder. 28. Graze akrasion Ŧ description 2.5" X 1" over the right scapular region 4" right to the midline and 6.5" below the tip of right shoulder. 29. Multiple abrasion (4 in number) ever an xres of 4" X 3.5" in the posterior chast wax almost over the midline 10" below the 2.5" X." over the right scappilar region 4" right to the middle end 0.5" below the up of right shoulder. 29. multiple aprassion (a in number) ever an Area of a A.J.D. in this posterior where the posterior where the posterior where the posterior where the posterior appear and an analysis of the sip of oteranin process. 31. Extravasation of blood 3.5" X.2" over and anound the left anterior superior illust spine. 32. Extravasation of blood 5" X.6" over the lateral aspect of left leg from the level of knee joint line and below: injury no. 5 as mentioned above. 33. Extravassation of blood 6" X 2" over the lateral aspect of lower third of left leg and below injury no. 6 as mentioned above. 34. Extravasation of blood 2.5" X 1" over the postero-lateral aspect of right 9rm 5.8° proximal to the tip of olectanon process. 35. Extravasation of blood 3" X 2" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. 36. Scalp hemixtom x 1.5" X 8.5" noted over the right yluteal region 2.5" above the gluteal fold and 2" right te middles. Parietal eminance, 32. Extravasation of blood 9" X 5" noted involving the left enterior chest wall, 38. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" poted involving the anterior lateral aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of left anterior chest wall, 39. Extravasation of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of lower part of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of lower part of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential aspect of Xlood 2.5" X 7" potential Xlood 2. econd to tenth ribs of left side; second and third along posterior asiliary line, fourth-fifth-sixth and seventh alons mid-clavicular line and eighth-ninch and tenth along posterior axiliary line with extravatation of blood at fracture sites n over the posterior aspect of left lung. All the injuries show evidence of ultal reactions. The abrasions are covered with reddish-brown scales at most places. The extravasation of blood are reddish-blue in colour. The argins of the lacerated wounds are adherent with each other at places and covered with dried crust at places. No other external or internal injuries could have been detected even after careful dissection and meticulous examination Opinion of the Medical Officer as to the cause of death Remarks by Civil Surgeon N.B. - In the case of wounds, note whether there is any indication of the wounds being *** Materials Preserved: \$.5tomach with whole of its contents, 30 cm of Imail intestine and its homiddai or otherwise coments, \$00 gm of liver with gali bladder, longitudinal naif of each kidney in saturated solution of common salt with control, 2. Blood without preservative, 3. Nail scrappings and cuttings, 4. Hair 5. Death was due to the effects of antemortem injuries as noted above. Wearing Apparels. All duly packed, labelled, sealed, signed and handed over to police for onward Further opinion, if any, will be given after receipt of Chemical Examiner's transmission for chemical examination. The whole Post Mortern was done under video photograph and the video casette was duly packed, labelled, sealed, signed and hended over to the escorting Asst. Professor police. ph of Resignar Suggeon of 1 Samueta Branco Civil Surgeon of State Medicine day of dical College, Kolle (2) Parlia Sana Chiful a 3/08/2012 **O**emonstrator CHWASIFAID, (3) Nalianila Adukari 03/08/22 copil of Forensig →pn of Forensio .

State Medicale

College

State Medicine

adioxi College Kan

IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA
CONSTITUTIONAL WRIT JURISDICTION
APPELLATE SIDE

W.P.A. (P) No.594 of 2022

In the matter of: An application under Article 226 of the Constitution of India.

-AND-In the matter of Association for Protection of Democratic Rights (APDR)& Another

......Petitioners
-VersusState of West Bengal & Others
......Opposite Parties

WRIT PETITION

SRIMOYEE MUKHERJEE
Advocate

Enl.No.

CHAMBER: 73A Banamali Naskar Road, Behala, Kolkata 700060 Mobile: 9674254576

89-19 Sukanta Maiky (WPA (F) -APDR vs State 28.11.22